

## Some Recent Publications on the ROMAN and SPANISH INQUISITIONS

*Inquisition d'Espagne*, ed. by Annie Molinié and Jean-Pierre Duvoils. Paris, Presses Universitaires de Paris-Sorbonne, 2003. Pp. 185.

*Inquisizioni: Percorsi di Ricerca*, ed. by Giovanna Paolin. Trieste, Edizione Università di Trieste, 2001. Pp. 301.

Stefania PASTORE, *Il Vangelo e la spada: L'inquisizione di Castiglia e i suoi critici (1460-1598)*. Temi e Testi 46: «Tribunali della Fede» Rome, Edizioni di storia e letterature, 2003. Pp. xvii, 491.

Ever since Henry Charles Lea a century ago, much of the best scholarship on the Spanish Inquisition has been published outside Spain (a recent electronic guide was co-authored by a Norwegian and a Japanese), although the same cannot be said of the modern Roman Inquisition. The encouraging news from early 21<sup>st</sup> century Europe is not only that fresh scholarship about both inquisitions continues to appear, but also that it seems increasingly inter-European. In this case, a continuing tradition of French research on Spain is complemented by the emergence of high-quality Italian work on the same subject.

Let us start with the French collection, which has the randomness of selected contributions from a conference – which in fact it is not. It contains nine contributions, including one in Spanish (one among four contributed by its *Comité de lecture*). The connections between its 16 pages of illustrations (six of them in color) and its detailed contents are unclear. For the most part, these contributions seem too specialized for novices, but unexciting to specialists. The only article which might justify spending twenty euros on it is a path-breaking essay on Jerez de la Frontera in the 1480s by Béatrice Perez (pp. 45-62). Perez first uses notarial archives from Seville to demonstrate the extent of «Christian» business habits among its *converso* population during the peak of inquisitorial repression in the 1480s: exactly one-sixth of her sample of 137 transactions took place on the Jewish Sabbath (p. 48 n. 12). Then she explores the municipal archives at Jerez, following a tangled trail of asset laundering by Andalusian *conversos* in the same period. Beyond illustrating once again the role of *conversos* in Andalusian political factionalism of the 1480s, Perez highlights a casual remark by Ferdinand the Catholic in 1484 that Spain's new Holy Office was a royal agency: Andalusian *conversos* were hiding their liquid assets «with great effrontery and without fear of God nor of my justice (*mi justicia*)» (p. 53). In other words, Perez has not only found a 'smoking gun' at Seville which seriously undermines Zionist claims that nearly all Spanish *conversos* were practicing Jews (nothing is more taboo than doing major business on the Sabbath), but she has also found another one at Jerez that flatly contradicts the Papacy's recent apology for the outrages of the Spanish Inquisition, which rests on the claim that it was responsible for them. More people need to know such things, rather than burying them anew in the learned obscurity of an otherwise forgettable collection.

Like its Parisian counterpart, the Trieste volume results from a loose collaboration rather than a conference. After their opening essays, both showcase mostly works by less well-known scholars and both include one truly notewor-

thy contribution – but the similarities end there. For the same price, it offers eight long essays (all in Italian) filling a hundred more pages. Both collections occasionally cover similar themes; for example, both offer highly concrete local examples of inquisitorial treatment of accused witches (pp. 95-108 in the Paris volume; pp. 203-215 in the Trieste volume). However, starting with its opening essay by Adriano Prosperi, the Trieste volume seems noticeably richer than its French counterpart in providing information which is both fresh and useful. For instance, it includes a long and meaty essay by Vincenzo Lavenia, surveying the poorly-understood jurisdictional conflicts over witchcraft in post-Tridentine Italy (pp. 35-80), uncovering the execution of possibly dozens of witches in Piedmont in 1619 or the stoning to death of a witch at Gubbio in the Papal states in 1633 (pp. 69, 56). This is followed by a closely-related topic, Guido Dall'Olio's exploration of a half-dozen increasingly 'diabolized' exorcism cases at Bologna in the 1560s (pp. 81-129) which provided the local background for Girolamo Menghi's famous handbook, first published at Bologna in 1576.

In an encouraging sign, it concludes with two contributions dealing with Spanish rather than Italian history. One had no discernable relation to any Inquisition (pp. 253-281), but instead introduced readers to 'Australia of the Holy Ghost', the new continent discovered by a Spanish expedition sailing from Lima in 1606 and named for the Spanish queen Margarita of Austria, adding a heavy dose of Franciscan apocalypticism. The other, Stefania Pastore's investigation of the intricate relationships among *conversos*, inquisitors, and the new Jesuit order (pp. 215-251), constitutes the real jewel of this collection. Because the early Jesuits were headed by a Spaniard based in Italy, Loyola could maintain working relationships simultaneously with the Spanish Holy Office (primarily through one of his Basque relatives) and with well-known *conversos* like Laynez; moreover, if a Spanish Jesuit like Diego de Guzman got into trouble with the Inquisition, Loyola could quickly re-assign him to a post outside Spain.

Unlike Beatrice Perez, who revealed significant discoveries in an obscure volume, Stefania Pastore has incorporated her pathbreaking essays (along with a few previous ones) into a broad and subtle investigation of various strands of opposition to the Spanish Inquisition. *Il Vangelo e la spada* constitutes an historiographical landmark: it is the single best work yet produced by an Italian scholar on the Spanish Inquisition. What gives it special cachet is a distinctively Italian perspective, derived partly from her mentor Prosperi, whose recent work on the intimate collaboration between the Roman Holy Office and post-Tridentine confessors casts a very long shadow over it. Pastore often builds on previous scholarship about Spain, but her work is constantly informed by developments in Rome and contrasted, often implicitly, with the different model of a centralised Holy Office developed in Italy. She offers a range of significantly different 'possible' versions of the Spanish Inquisition, glimpsed by Spanish critics, most of them ecclesiastics, at various moments since the mid-15<sup>th</sup> century prelude to its foundation. Pastore's point of departure is the history of the Hieronymite order published by fray José de Siguenza (himself a former prisoner of the Holy Office) between 1600 and 1605.

Beginning with Siguenza's illustrious fellow Hieronymites Alonso de Oropesa, the first major opponent of *limpieza di sangre*, and the first archbishop of Granada, Hernando de Talavera, a miscellany of Spanish bishops and monks

populate Pastore's pages. Although a sprinkling of Franciscans and Dominicans also populate her pages, many protagonists of her later chapters are Jesuits. Unlike such early *converso* troublemakers as Juan de Lucena, tried at Cordoba and Zaragoza in 1503, whose written objections to the Inquisition must be reconstructed (like those of medieval heretics) from fragments of charges made by his judges (pp. 91-95), those Spanish Jesuits like Diego de Guzman who subsequently got into serious trouble with the Holy Office – usually over their claim to hear and absolve cases of heresy privately – could be concealed and the offender quickly transferred elsewhere, as happened as late as 1576 (pp. 424, 426) or even 1586 (pp. 441, 451).

All of Pastore's protagonists desired to entrust the repression of heresy to some ecclesiastical body, usually under episcopal control and managed by theologians, rather than a royal agency staffed overwhelmingly by civil lawyers, which the Spanish Holy Office became from its very beginnings. However, all these would-be reformers failed, and the history of the Spanish Inquisition is usually written as though the outcome was inevitable, reflecting what Pastore calls «una volontà di sovrapposizione storiografica e mistificazione che sembra aver trionfato dalle origini dell'Inquisizione spagnola fino quasi a lambire alcune moderne interpretazioni» (p. 55).

The Papacy is more visible in Pastore's account than in most Spanish histories of the subject, and she suggests (pp. 74f) that further research in such places as the archives of the Roman penitentiary, where Spanish cases appear to predominate, would make the papacy's role still more significant. For example, after enabling the peculiar early development of the Spanish Inquisition and even staging the «commedia» (p. 83) of an *auto de fe* at Rome by a Spanish pope in 1498, the papacy painstakingly regained a few pieces of its authority over the repression of heresy in Spain through the heated debates about episcopal residency at the Council of Trent or with its ultimately successful struggle for jurisdiction over Archbishop Carranza. By the early 17<sup>th</sup> century, claims Pastore, «il Sant'Uffizio romano acquisì un peso e un'autorità sempre maggiore e sempre più numerose furono le occasioni in cui si pronunciò direttamente su questioni spagnole» (464).

All in all, *Il Vangelo e la spada* constitutes what is almost a work of resurrection. The last word surely belongs to the author: «Sono certo che si debba restituire anche al Cinquecento spagnolo tutta la complessità del percorso che portò il tribunale della fede spagnolo a imporsi e a trionfare all'interno della società castigliana, ma a farlo all'interno di un quadro mosso, variegato, in cui le pluralità di forze in gioco, vescovi, confessori, missionari, non rinunciarono ad esercitare un proprio ruolo» (464). Employing a fresh Italian perspective, Pastore has added some much-needed *sfumato* to our conventional picture of a triumphant Spanish Inquisition, depicting a Spain which seems less monolithic and more fragmented.

Wilmette, IL (USA).

William MONTER