

proof, and the relation of public and private rights. She then uses the sumptuary legislation of Forlì from the fourteenth through the sixteenth centuries to illustrate some fruits of this long evolution in one concrete case and closes with reflections on Antonio Roselli's 1447 *consilium, De ornatu mulierum*.

If approached as an extended essay or thought-piece, the work can sensitize historians to the theological and legal issues raised by medieval and early modern sumptuary legislation. It is not, however, convincing as intellectual history. How, for example, could the *dottrina tomista* be the “new impulse” driving the legal thought of Henry of Susa (Hostiensis) on sumptuary law when Natalini grounds the Thomist “doctrine” in Aquinas's *Summa* (c. 1265–1274) and Susa's cited *Summa* is dated to c. 1230–1253? The author also gives no consideration to political developments within the urban republics producing sumptuary legislation. Shouldn't sumptuary legislation in the second half of the thirteenth century be placed in the context of the rise of *Popolo* movements within these cities and their anti-magnate legislation? In sum, Natalini's narrative regarding the importance of Christian thought to the birth of the modern state and its legal foundations will please those already convinced of this position but will not win any converts to this view.

University of California, Berkeley

MAUREEN C. MILLER

*Propaganda Fide*, Volume I: *La congregazione pontificia e la giurisdizione sulle missioni*. By Giovanni Pizzorusso. (Rome: Edizioni Storia e Letteratura. 2022. Pp. 427. €48.00. ISBN 978-8893-5959-64.)

The idea of the conversion of the non-Christians, making their salvation possible, is a fundamental concept of the Christian church, whose missionary drive can thus be traced back to its very origins. In the sixteenth century, the opening of new missions in the Orient and the Iberian expansion into the Americas made the Holy See acquiesce to the *padronato* regime, which de facto entrusted to the Iberian regular orders most missionary activity. The bull *Exponis Nobis Nuper Fecisti*, commonly known as *Omnimoda* (May 10, 1522), officially granted unlimited powers to the missionaries. It was partially curtailed by the bull *Cum Onerosa Pastoralis Officii Cura* (December 12, 1600). Soon afterwards, the Sacred Congregation “de Propaganda Fide,” officially established by Pope Gregory XV on January 6, 1622, became a main element in Rome's attempt to regain its centralizing role in the missionary activity and to contain the power of the Iberian crowns. Propaganda was meant to propagate the faith where the Gospel had never been preached (infidels, heathen); to defend Catholic minorities in non-Catholic human environments (Muslims, Anglicans, Confucians); and to reclaim the erring flock that had abandoned the true faith (heretics, schismatics)—an “immense” (p.113) task that the pope had entrusted to a dozen or so cardinals and a few bureaucrats who were housed in a Roman palace located a few yards from the Spanish Steps. Propaganda's top cardinal (the Prefect) and the Secretary (the workaholic Francesco Ingoli from 1622 to 1649 (p. 120) met practically every day in a *congresso*; the full house met once a month in *congregazione generale*. The pope had the last word, although regular

*udienze* only began in the 1660s. (This routine went on almost unchanged until the early twentieth century.)

Giovanni Pizzorusso is an early-modern historian who has moved from an initial interest in one of the Catholic peripheries—the Americas—to a deep knowledge of the inner working of the Holy See in its relationship with the global world. He has now produced the first volume of a major synthesis of the history of Propaganda such as has never been written before, one that is likely to remain the fundamental point of reference for all historians who will write on the history of the Catholic missions for decades to come. This volume describes why and how Propaganda was founded, how it was financed, its role within the Roman bureaucracy, its relationship with other Roman ministries (mainly the nunciatures and the Sacred Congregation of the Holy Office) and with the regular orders (mainly the Jesuits and the Capuchins). To be sure, *Propaganda Fide* is not an original work, in the sense that Pizzorusso has revised eighteen articles, chapters, and conference papers that he had published or presented between 1998 and 2016—hence some repetitions here and there. Still, his texts have been reworked in such a fashion as to provide the reader with a new and coherent interpretation of the history of the Congregation and of its role within the Roman bureaucracy and the world of missions. Furthermore, all his texts *were* original when they were written. To this day they, they remain unsurpassed and provide the ground for a major historiographical reappraisal of the role of Propaganda. In the book, they are preceded by a lengthy interpretive introduction which is completely new.

Pizzorusso well describes how, in an amazingly unchanging fashion, for about three centuries Propaganda officials centred their overall strategy of worldwide evangelization around some long-term objectives that can be thus summarized: (i) the dissemination of the Tridentine pattern as regarded rites and sacraments (such as marriages and baptisms); (ii) the replacement of the European clergy through the creation of an autochthonous clergy, their “most ambitious” but “eventually illusory” endeavor (p. 202); (iii) the use of vernacular languages, alongside Latin, as a necessary step in any “foreign” relationship; (iv) the organization of well-structured territorial churches consisting of bishops, vicars apostolic, prefects apostolic, and apostolic missionaries; (v) the collaboration with the regular orders as much as the latter allowed (Jesuits and Dominicans were particularly jealous of their prerogatives); (vi) the gathering of missionary information and the careful keeping of an institutional memory of it.

A few pioneer Québec and American scholars who had realized that the history of the Catholic missions did not stop at the door of the Society of Jesus—such as Conrad-Marie Morin (1906–84), Lucien Campeau (1914–2003), Charles Edwards O’Neill (1927–2009), Lucien Lemieux (1934–2020), and Robert Frederick Trisco—had made significant use of the Propaganda archives. Later, researchers would start off by looking up their topic of interest in the appropriate chapter of *Memoria Rerum* (1971–76). This was a collective *magnus opus* put together by Josef Metzler, O.M.I. (1921–2012), Propaganda’s archivist from 1966

to 1984. However, most of them took advantage of the riches of the Propaganda archives to illuminate, in greater detail, the history of their own country, their order, their mission or character of choice. None had placed the Congregation itself at the center of their scrutiny and had looked to the outside world with the eyes of those Propaganda bureaucrats who produced their responses to local situations by evaluating concomitant experiences, past and present (p. 29). This more refined perspective is, in fact, what Pizzorusso has achieved during over three decades of focused research—his extensive archival references and footnotes, a testimony to Pizzorusso's thoroughness and dedication. (Hopefully Volume II will carry a full bibliography.)

To be sure, *Propaganda Fide* is not a chronicle. The book is thematically organized, and any quick overview would not do justice to its richness. Let us just mention some of the book's main historiographical novelties or reinterpretations, none of which a researcher would find by identifying his or her chapter of choice in *Memoria Rerum* or even by reading its 4,550-odd pages cover to cover. Missionaries did not really make any distinction between distant and "internal" missions (pp. 19, 220, 307); indeed, distance was not a decisive factor in selecting and assisting missions (p. vii). Conflict is less a feature of the missionary world than it appears to be, because "normal situations" produce less documentation (p. 313). With regard to the Society of Jesus, commonly regarded as Propaganda's *bête noire*, the Congregation's anti-Jesuitism is a useless abstraction that must be placed in a prosopographical context that re-evaluates the role of personalities (pp. 111, 362–384); furthermore, the suppression of the Society (1773–1814) must be regarded as an interlude of "no great significance" (p. 403). Most significantly, the activity of Propaganda, in conjunction with the Holy Office—in spite of the latter's eminent role of guardian of the true doctrine—shows that the imposition of canon law and the dissemination of the Tridentine pattern went along with a continuous adaptation to local situations, so that "missions became the lieu of exception, not of the rule" (p. 195, but see also pp. 72, 189, 193, 216–219, 297).

Pizzorusso makes rare, if any, explicit concessions to fashionable or politically correct historiographical trends. Although the necessary link between missionary dissemination and colonial expansion is often mentioned—see for example the pages on the missionaries' "double" loyalties (pp. 231–241)—the word "colonialism" is used sparsely, and the word "inculturation" only once (p. 229). There is also a fleeting mention of the "global or connected histories," again in one sentence only (pp. 189–190), whereas the direct influence of French and Italian church historians such as Bernard Dompnier, Claude Prudhomme, and Adriano Prosperi, or of the Spanish legal historian Eutimio Sastre Santos, is more evident and explicitly acknowledged.

Even such a good book leaves room for improvements. On the substantial side, this reviewer would have liked a more detailed description of the apostolic faculties (spiritual powers), which are also missing in the Index as a separate entry. (Baptisms and Marriages are also missing, though Languages and Rites are there.)

The twenty-six doubts on baptisms and marriages among the Indians of Canada, assessed in Rome in 1702, had been submitted by the bishop of Québec, Jean-Baptiste de La Croix de Chevrières de Saint-Vallier, not by the Jesuits (p. 85). The early seventeenth-century mission of Avalon was in Newfoundland, not in Nova Scotia (p. 292). The archival references to Michele Di Pietro's *Geografia Ecclesiastica* treatise are garbled. Finally, although the book is remarkably almost free of typos, there are a few names that need to be revised, either in the text or in the Index: The correct forms are Jean-Olivier Briand, Joseph-Marie Chaumonot, Michel Gazil de La Bernardière, Karen Ordahl Kupperman, Bernard Picques, and Jan Philipp Roothaan. Finally, Giovanni Damasceno Bragaldi is indexed as Damasceno (a common occurrence in his times), but his real family name was Bragaldi.

In conclusion, *Propaganda Fide* is a major piece of historical scholarship in the field of early modern history, the history of the Catholic Church and of the Holy See—in particular Propaganda and the Holy Office—missionary studies, and the history of mission fields around the world. Its author and its publisher must be warmly congratulated. We eagerly look forward to the publication of Vol II.

*University of Notre Dame  
and Saint Mary's University (Halifax)*

LUCA CODIGNOLA

*Kindred Spirits: Friendship and Resistance at the Edges of Modern Catholicism.* By Brenna Moore. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 2021. Pp. 322. \$32.50. ISBN 9780226787015.)

In *Kindred Spirits*, Brenna Moore boldly theorizes and accomplishes a genuinely global Catholic intellectual history for the 2020s. Moore examines an international network of writers, theologians, artists, and activists between 1920 and 1960. The sprawling diversity of identities, crossing and hybridizing religious, ethnic, racial, gender and sexual borders, is unified by Catholicism's global reach and inexhaustible capacity for accommodating local contexts. Although the figures were dispersed in places as distant as Chile, Egypt, France, Jamaica, and Russia—as well as Chicago and New York—they all shared the city of Paris at some time in their lives. Moore comes to this story with authority stemming from her 2012 monograph *Sacred Dread: Raïssa Maritain, the Allure of Suffering, and the French Catholic Revival (1905–1944)*. In that work, Moore's unpacking of Maritain's richly textured life led her to explore the roles played by salons organized by women. Salons—and their cultivation of friendships—served as sites of refuge and belonging for ex-patriots, émigrés, and exiles (like Maritain herself). Nearly a decade later, Moore has built on this foundation as she pushes Catholic intellectual history beyond these earlier borders.

Moore argues for the category of “friendship” playing a vital role in analyzing this global community and, more particularly, “spiritual friendship” as the binding force. On one level, this actively chosen spiritual kinship—hence, *Kindred Spirits*—gave participants a shared identity and belonging that transcended passive forms of